

New Orleans Historic District Landmarks Commission
Architectural Review Committee
Meeting Minutes

Date: February 20, 2018

Location: City Hall, 1300 Perdido Street, 8th Floor Homeland Security Conference Room, New Orleans, LA, 70112.

Called to order: 12:30 p.m.

Adjourned: 4:00 p.m.

Members present: John Klingman, Cynthia Dubberley, Robbie Cangelosi, Elliott Perkins

Members arriving after beginning of the meeting: Beth Jacob

Members absent:

I. AGENDA

1. Approval of the minutes of the January 16, 2018 meeting

Motion: Approve the minutes.

By: Elliott Perkins

Second: Cynthia Dubberley

Result: Passed

In favor: Elliott Perkins, John Klingman, Cynthia Dubberley, Robbie Cangelosi

Opposed:

Comments:

At this time, Beth Jacob arrived.

2. 3700 Canal St.

Application: Heather Little, applicant; Rectors Wardens And Vestrymen Of Grace Church, owner;
Renovation of an existing Landmark church and rectory to include the construction of a residential care center four-story addition.

Speakers: Joshua Roth, Brady Lester, Mary Mysing, Doody Lester, Beverly Walker, Mary Howell spoke against the application.

Motion: John Klingman made a motion to defer this application for additional review. The ARC agreed reducing the proposal to three (3) stories from four (4) stories was an improvement, though the mass of the addition is still out of scale with the neighborhood context, overwhelms the original Landmark structure, and remains too dense on the existing footprint. The ARC agreed the revised proposal is moving more towards a suburban apartment typology than contextual historic urban infill. The ARC recommended flipping the program of the addition to move the occupied spaces to the edge of the street, and the parking to the interior of the site. The ARC made note that this change would bring more natural light into the occupied space, i.e. the Memory Care Suites with windows into the parking lot. In making this change, they also recommended that the addition respect the existing setback of the Church on Telemachus Street. With regard to the articulating and materials of the facade(s), the ARC recommended additional study of the geometries, materials, and detailing of the Landmark Church and Rectory to create cohesion and continuity between the addition and the original historic structure, i.e. pulling the horizontal datum from the Church through the new addition, or the incorporation of brick or stucco, or both as an exterior material at the addition. The ARC suggested approaching the

Church/Rectory/Addition as more of an integrated campus rather than as individual elements on a parcel. The ARC recommended shifting the elevator tower further into the site to a less conspicuous location as its current location overwhelms the Church and Rectory at the Canal Street elevation. The ARC also recommended investigating the possibility of changing Telemachus Street to a two-way street rather than the existing one-way to alleviate the traffic and circulation issues.

Second: Robbie Cangelosi

Result: Passed

In favor: Elliott Perkins, John Klingman, Cynthia Dubberley, Beth Jacob, Robbie Cangelosi

Opposed:

Comments:

3. 3000 St. Claude Ave.

Application: EDR Architects, applicant; 3000-3032 St Claude Ave LLC, 3000-3032 St Claude Ave LLC, owner; Renovation of five existing buildings into a hotel, including the new construction of a building on the site. This project includes five parcels: municipal address 3000, 3014, 3020-22, 3024-26, and 3030-32 St. Claude Avenue.

Speakers: Danielle Maggio, Bettina Reutter, Miguel Montarell, Eve Abrams, Kourtney Keller, Jami A Henbery, Carolyn Leftwich, and Michael Bolan spoke against the application.

Motion: Elliott Perkins made a motion to recommend conceptual approval of the proposal with the details to be worked out at the Staff level. The ARC made the following recommendations:

- Update the entry design per what type of signage is approved for this zoning.
- Articulate the porch of the new building on St Claude to include an awning or “eyebrow”
- The restaurant development still appears to be unresolved and does not reference the pedestrian condition enough.

Second: Cynthia Dubberley

Result: Passed

In Favor: Elliott Perkins, John Klingman, Cynthia Dubberley, Beth Jacob, Robbie Cangelosi

Opposed:

Comments:

4. 917 Vallete St.

Application: Lynnette Gordon, applicant; Bwb Enterprised Ltd LLC, owner; Construct new two-story, single-family residential building.

Motion: Robbie Cangelosi made a motion to recommend conceptual approval of the proposal with further details to be worked out at the Staff level. The ARC made the following recommendations:

- The style of the building should be simplified, with rectangular box columns instead of turned posts, rectangular-head windows, etc.
- The light configuration of the windows needs to be adjusted – the individual panes should have a more vertical orientation, rather than horizontal.
- The front gable should align with the wall below. There should also be a gable vent in the front gable.
- The front steps should be in line with the front door.
- Add a window at the front right side of the building (similar to left side elevation).
- Extending the Hardie siding down to enclose the crawl space is not appropriate. The building should have a brick or concrete block chainwall at the front porch with open piers down the sides.
- Increase the roof pitch to 7/12.
- The front windows should be normal height windows without the wood panel below.

Second: Cynthia Dubberley

Result: Passed

In favor: Elliott Perkins, John Klingman, Cynthia Dubberley, Beth Jacob, Robbie Cangelosi

Opposed:

Comments:

5. 3210 N Rampart St.

Application: Lesley Poche, applicant; 600 S Alexander St LLC, owner; New Construction of a two-story, single family 1,800 SF residential building with off street parking.

Motion: John Klingman made a motion to recommend conceptual approval of the proposal with the details to be worked out at the Staff level. The ARC made the following recommendations:

- Resolve the spacing and materiality (high quality kiln dried wood treated for exterior installation) for the screening.
- Resolve trim details on all openings.
- Control joint at stucco locations are too pronounced. Should be reduced to 1/8" and subtle.
- Balcony fascia trim board should wrap the porch and continue partially down the left elevation.
- Overall, the project need the construction detailing worked out in a highly refined way, as contemporary materials are being used.

Second: Robbie Cangelosi

Result: Passed

In favor: Elliott Perkins, John Klingman, Cynthia Dubberley, Beth Jacob, Robbie Cangelosi

Opposed:

Comments:

6. 437 First St.

Application: Corey Newell, applicant; Sandra R Armelin, owner; New construction of two-story, single-family residential building.

Motion: John Klingman made a motion to recommend conceptual approval with the details to be worked out at the Staff level. The ARC agreed that the horizontal slats at the front porch should be as proposed in the original application or as per option two presented at the meeting.

Second: Cynthia Dubberley

Result: Passed

In favor: Elliott Perkins, John Klingman, Cynthia Dubberley, Beth Jacob, Robbie Cangelosi

Opposed:

Comments:

7. 1130 Thalia St.

Application: Ingrid M Patin, applicant/owner; Enclose portion of the first & second floor porch at the front elevation.

Motion: Beth Jacob made a motion to recommend conceptual approval of the proposal with the details to be worked out at the Staff level. The louvered screen condition should extend to the second floor, and the openings should be organized in 3 equal pairs.

Second: Robbie Cangelosi

Result: Passed

In favor: Elliott Perkins, John Klingman, Cynthia Dubberley, Beth Jacob, Robbie Cangelosi

Opposed:

Comments:

8. 1355 Magazine St.
Comments: This item was deferred to the end of the agenda.

9. 701 Forstall St.
Comments: This item was withdrawn.

10. 1227 Feliciana St.
Application: Ed Keenan, applicant; SMS Development LLC, owner; New construction single-family residential building on a vacant lot.
Motion: Elliott Perkins made a motion to recommend conceptual approval of the proposal with the details to be worked out at the Staff level. The ARC made the following recommendations:

- The HDLC does not approve exposed piling foundations. The foundation should be revised to be a traditional masonry pier foundation.
- Windows should be recessed mounted as well as have traditional trim and sills.
- All openings should have header heights aligned with other opening on the same story. Add transom at side elevation door to align header heights.
- The front porch needs to be redesigned such that it is accessible from the home and from the street.
- The depth of the front porch needs to be increased as much as possible with respect to the existing foundation. Cantilevers can be utilized to maximize depth.
- The second floor windows should be designed with the same divisions on the top and bottom sash.
- The window divisions and proportions should be altered such that the divisions are vertically oriented.
- Bring the front wall of the camelback towards the street and align with the side porch entry wall to simplify roof structure and building form.
- An awning on the side entry door should be included in the design and the brackets utilized should be appropriately sized to fit the overhang.

Second: Robbie Cangelosi

Result: Passed

In favor: Elliott Perkins, John Klingman, Cynthia Dubberley, Beth Jacob, Robbie Cangelosi

Opposed:

11. 1406 Clouet St.

Application: Loretta Harmon, applicant; Willie L Adams, owner; New construction of a 1700 SF single-family residential building on a vacant lot.

Motion: Elliott Perkins made a motion to recommend conceptual approval of the proposal with the details to be worked out at the Staff level. The ARC made the following recommendations:

- Add window to left side elevation. At least one window in the front “Living” room and down the interior side hall.
- Attic ventilation such as gable vents need to be added to the design.
- Widen the front entry stairs to the full width between the column bay of the front entry.

Second: Robbie Cangelosi

Result: Passed

In favor: Elliott Perkins, John Klingman, Cynthia Dubberley, Beth Jacob, Robbie Cangelosi

Opposed:

Comments:

12. 937 Third St.

Application: Edward Fleming, applicant; Christopher T Dodd, owner; Renovate existing two story, single family residential building and construct two story addition.

Motion: Robbie Cangelosi made a motion to defer this application for additional review. After reviewing the historic photo, the building looks to be a camelback that was infilled. The proportions of the double gallery proposed are not appropriate and the front elevation needs to be studied further. The doors at the right side elevation should be setback from the edge of the building, French doors would be more appropriate at this location. The roof at the side addition should be hipped, and all window head heights should align.

Second: Cynthia Dubberley

Result: Passed

In favor: Elliott Perkins, John Klingman, Cynthia Dubberley, Beth Jacob, Robbie Cangelosi

Opposed:

Comments:

13. 1127 Terpsichore St.

Application: James Brown, applicant; Coliseum Place Baptist Church, owner; New construction of two-story, single-family, residential building.

Motion: Robbie Cangelosi made a motion to recommend conceptual approval with the details to be worked out at the Staff level.

Second: Cynthia Dubberley

Result: Passed

In favor: Elliott Perkins, John Klingman, Cynthia Dubberley, Beth Jacob, Robbie Cangelosi

Opposed:

Comments:

14. 1376 Camp St.
Application: James Brown, applicant; Coliseum Place Baptist Church, owner; New construction of two-story, single-family, residential building.
Motion: Robbie Cangelosi made a motion to recommend conceptual approval with the details to be worked out at the Staff level. The ARC agreed that the window types and locations need to be studied at the side elevations. Windows should not be located at the edge of the building walls. The guardrail banding at the ground floor columns should be removed. Brackets should be as deep as the porch overhang. The doors on the Camp St elevation should be a single pane over panel. Also, the applicant should clarify what the material is in the gable at the front elevation.
Second: Cynthia Dubberley
Result: Passed
In favor: Elliott Perkins, John Klingman, Cynthia Dubberley, Beth Jacob, Robbie Cangelosi
Opposed:
Comments:
15. 3319 St Claude St.
Comments: This item was withdrawn.
16. 614 St Roch St.
Application: Rick A. Fifield, applicant; Michael L Lintner, owner; New construction of a rooftop addition on existing one-story residential building.
Motion: Robbie Cangelosi made a motion to recommend conceptual approval of the proposal with the details to be worked out at the Staff level. The ARC agreed the addition appears too tall and recommended dividing and stepping the front piece down to reduce the height from a pedestrian perspective. The ARC agreed the proposal appeared horizontal and recommended adding a parapet on the original building. The ARC recommended changing the smooth finish stucco panel at the bottom of the addition at the front elevation to a more transparent material, i.e. wood horizontal louvers.
Second: Beth Jacob
Result: Passed
In favor: Elliott Perkins, John Klingman, Cynthia Dubberley, Beth Jacob, Robbie Cangelosi
Opposed:
Comments:
17. 819 N Villere St.
Application: Natalie Deliso, applicant; Schoen Fuselier Co LLC, owner; New construction of two-story, two-family residential building.
Motion: Elliott Perkins made a motion to recommend conceptual approval of the massing of the new two-story, two-family residence provided that the two sister houses at 819 and 817 N Villere are no longer mirrored and the accessory structure becomes taller.
Second: Cynthia Dubberley
Result: Passed
In favor: Elliott Perkins, John Klingman, Cynthia Dubberley, Beth Jacob, Robbie Cangelosi
Opposed:
Comments:

18. 817 N Villere St.
Application: Natalie Deliso, applicant; Schoen Fuselier Co LLC, owner; New construction of two-story, two-family residential building.
Motion: Robbie Cangelosi made a motion to recommend conceptual approval of the massing of the new two-story, two-family residence provided that the two sister houses at 819 and 817 N Villere are no longer mirrored and the accessory structure becomes taller.
Second: Cynthia Dubberley
Result: Passed
In favor: Elliott Perkins, John Klingman, Cynthia Dubberley, Beth Jacob, Robbie Cangelosi
Opposed:
Comments:
19. 2315 Laurel St.
Application: Samuel Bavido, applicant; Michael Gunaldo, owner; Construct camelback addition to existing two-family, residential building.
Motion: Elliott Perkins made a motion to recommend conceptual approval of the camelback addition with the details to be worked out at the Staff level. The proposed side gallery is still under review. The ARC agreed that the gallery should be setback one bay, and the existing side wall and window openings should be retained to make the change less visible from the public right of way.
Second: Cynthia Dubberley
Result: Passed
In favor: Elliott Perkins, John Klingman, Cynthia Dubberley, Beth Jacob, Robbie Cangelosi
Opposed:
Comments:
- Motion: Elliott Perkins made a motion to defer the side gallery for further review.
Second: Robbie Cangelosi
Result: Passed
In favor: Elliott Perkins, John Klingman, Cynthia Dubberley, Beth Jacob, Robbie Cangelosi
Opposed:
Comments:
20. 527 First St.
Comments: This item was deferred to the end of the agenda.

21. 3015 N Rampart St.

Application: Daniel Kautz, applicant; Fontaine A Wells, Aaron L Edsinger, owner; New construction of one-story, single-family residential building.

Motion: Elliott Perkins made a motion to recommended conceptual approval of the proposal with the details to be worked out at the Staff level. The ARC made the following recommendations:

- The stair railing, as proposed, is not consistent with the rest of the design language in the building.
- Investigate front stair orientation to reflect the stepped massing of the building.
- Add another window in the front wall of the building behind the wood screen on the front porch area.
- Investigate ways to space the openings or adjust shutter mechanics such that they can remain open and flush to the wall.

Second: Cynthia Dubberley

Result: Passed

In favor: Elliott Perkins, John Klingman, Cynthia Dubberley, Beth Jacob, Robbie Cangelosi

Opposed:

Comments:

22. 1355 Magazine St.

Comments: This item was withdrawn.

23. 527 First St.

Comments: This item was withdrawn.

At this time, there being no further business to discuss, the meeting was adjourned.